Does the Hadith Corpus Degrade the Status of Prophet Musa?

by

Bassam Zawadi

Argument:

We read the following hadith in Saheeh Bukhari, Volume 1, Book 5, Number 277:

Narrated Abu Huraira:

The Prophet said, 'The (people of) Bani Israel used to take bath naked (all together) looking at each other. The Prophet Moses used to take a bath alone. They said, 'By Allah! Nothing prevents Moses from taking a bath with us except that he has a scrotal hernia.' So once Moses went out to take a bath and put his clothes over a stone and then that stone ran away with his clothes. Moses followed that stone saying, "My clothes, O stone! My clothes, O stone! till the people of Bani Israel saw him and said, 'By Allah, Moses has got no defect in his body. Moses took his clothes and began to beat the stone." Abu Huraira added, "By Allah! There are still six or seven marks present on the stone from that excessive beating."

How can All-Mighty Allah allow His great Prophet to be humiliated like this and be seen naked? Couldn't have Allah found another way to clear Prophet Musa (peace be upon him) from these false charges? If not, then was it so important that He must have cleared Prophet Musa (peace be upon him) from these charges?

Response:

It was important that Allah cleared Prophet Musa (peace be upon him) from the false charges of Bani Israel, for it might have potentially led to worse results such as them using these false rumors as an excuse not to follow Prophet Musa (peace be upon him) anymore and apostatize.

This way of clearing Prophet Musa (peace be upon him) from these false charges is not unwarranted? Bani Israel was so stubborn that they would only believe in what they saw. Even after Allah assisted Prophet Musa (peace be upon him) in overcoming Pharoah's magicians, helping Prophet Musa (peace be upon him) part the sea, and even after He made twelve springs gush forth from a rock for Bani Israel to drink, Bani Israel still had the nerve to demand that they see Allah in order to believe (2:55). Given this, it appears highly unlikely that they would have dismissed these rumors surrounding Prophet Musa (peace be upon him) without seeing for themselves.

Was Prophet Musa (peace be upon him) humiliated and degraded? No, it is not like Allah asked Prophet Musa (peace be upon him) to go and intentionally remove his clothes and get naked in front of Bani Israel. Rather, Allah used this miraculous and creative technique of proving the innocence of Prophet Musa (peace be upon him). Furthermore, notice that the first part of the

hadith states, "The (people of) Bani Israel used to take bath naked (all together) looking at each other." This means that it was common for Bani Israel to see the other naked; hence, seeing Prophet Musa (peace be upon him) naked was not considered humiliating and embarrassed about.

Some have tried to provide an analogy between this story and some of the stories found in the Bible which degrade the Prophets. However, this is not convincing as is perfectly stated over here:

There is a difference between this story and what is found in the books of the Christians and the Jews which are full of allegations and accusations of defects and shortcomings imputed to the Prophets and Messengers of Allah. Indeed did not intend to show his Awrah (private parts) to his people as he went to a remote place away from any sight. But the stone ran away with his clothes. So, he ran behind it in order to get his clothes and he did not know that he would encounter anybody in the area. Surprisingly a group of his people happened to be in that very area. So, they saw him. Allah wanted to acquit Prophet Musa from his people's accusations. So, Musa's innocence was proved through this great miracle. There is nothing in the Hadith nor the verse that decreases the honor of Musa. On the contrary, this verse and Hadith express clearly and eloquently, the frankness of Musa, and his high qualities both morally and physically. The verse and the Hadith also stress the prohibition of accusing Prophet Musa or any other Prophets of things that are not suitable to him or them.

On the other hand, the Sharia does not deny that Prophets are normal people who could be seen nude. What the Sharia denies is the fact that any Prophet could willingly take his clothes in front of people to show them his naked body. This is impossible.

In conclusion, this argument carries no weight.